

1 **Satellite estimates of net community production indicate**
2 **predominance of net autotrophy in the Atlantic Ocean.**

3 **Gavin H. Tilstone^{1*}, Yu-yuan Xie^{1,2#}, Carol Robinson³, Pablo Serret⁴, Dionysios E.**
4 **Raitsos¹, Timothy Powell¹, Maria Aranguren-Gassis^{4,5#}, Enma Elena Garcia-Martin^{3#,4},**
5 **Vassilis Kitidis¹.**

6 ¹Plymouth Marine Laboratory, Prospect Place, Plymouth, PL1 3DH, UK

7 ²College of Environment and Ecology, Xiamen University, Xiamen 361005, China

8 ³Centre for Ocean and Atmospheric Sciences, School of Environmental Sciences,
9 University of East Anglia, Norwich, NR4 7TJ, UK

10 ⁴Department of Ecology and Animal Biology, University of Vigo, E36309 Vigo, Spain

11 ⁵Kellogg Biological Station, Michigan State University, Hickory Corners, 49060
12 Michigan, USA.

13
14
15 #Current address.

16
17
18
19
20 **KEY WORDS:** Atlantic Ocean, Net community production, Respiration, Photosynthesis,
21 Multivariate ENSO Index, North Atlantic Oscillation, Pacific Decadal Oscillation.

22 **RUNNING PAGE HEAD:** Net community production in the Atlantic Ocean
23

* Corresponding author. Email: ghti@pml.ac.uk

24 **ABSTRACT.**

25 There is ongoing debate as to whether the oligotrophic ocean is predominantly net
26 autotrophic and acts as a CO₂ sink, or net heterotrophic and therefore acts as a CO₂ source to
27 the atmosphere. This quantification is challenging, both spatially and temporally, due to the
28 sparseness of measurements. There has been a concerted effort to derive accurate estimates of
29 phytoplankton photosynthesis and primary production from satellite data to fill these gaps;
30 however there have been few satellite estimates of net community production (NCP). In this
31 paper, we compare a number of empirical approaches to estimate NCP from satellite data
32 with *in vitro* measurements of changes in dissolved O₂ concentration at 295 stations in the N
33 and S Atlantic Ocean (including the Antarctic), Greenland and Mediterranean Seas.
34 Algorithms based on power laws between NCP and particulate organic carbon production
35 (POC) derived from ¹⁴C uptake tend to overestimate NCP at negative values and
36 underestimate at positive values. An algorithm that includes sea surface temperature (SST) in
37 the power function of NCP and ¹⁴C POC has the lowest bias and root-mean square error
38 compared with *in vitro* measured NCP and is the most accurate algorithm for the Atlantic
39 Ocean. Nearly a 13 year time series of NCP was generated using this algorithm with
40 SeaWiFS data to assess changes over time in different regions and in relation to climate
41 variability. The North Atlantic subtropical and tropical Gyres (NATL) were predominantly
42 net autotrophic from 1998 to 2010 except for boreal autumn/winter, suggesting that the
43 northern hemisphere has remained a net sink for CO₂ during this period. The South Atlantic
44 sub-tropical Gyre (SATL) fluctuated from being net autotrophic in austral spring-summer, to
45 net heterotrophic in austral autumn-winter. Recent decadal trends suggest that the SATL is
46 becoming more of a CO₂ source. Over the Atlantic basin, the percentage of satellite pixels
47 with negative NCP was 27 %, with the largest contributions from the NATL and SATL
48 during boreal and austral autumn-winter, respectively. Variations in NCP in the northern and

49 southern hemispheres were correlated with climate indices. Negative correlations between
50 NCP and the multivariate ENSO index (MEI) occurred in the SATL, which explained up to
51 60% of the variability in NCP. Similarly there was a negative correlation between NCP and
52 the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) in the Southern Sub-Tropical Convergence Zone
53 (SSTC), which explained 90 % of the variability. There were also positive correlations with
54 NAO in the CNRY and Western Tropical Atlantic (WTRA) which explained 80 and 60 % of
55 the variability in each province, respectively. MEI and NAO seem to play a role in modifying
56 phases of net autotrophy and heterotrophy in the Atlantic Ocean.

57 **1. Introduction**

58 Marine photosynthesis and respiration mediate the exchange of CO₂ between the oceans
59 and atmosphere. Gross primary production (GPP) equates to the amount of CO₂ taken up by
60 marine autotrophic plankton, and Net Community Production (NCP) is the difference
61 between GPP and the organic carbon lost through autotrophic and heterotrophic respiration
62 (R). NCP plays a key role in connecting trophic and biogeochemical dynamics of pelagic
63 ecosystems, through metabolic balance between GPP and R and the subsequent fate of carbon
64 through export or release to the atmosphere. There is ongoing debate as to whether the
65 oligotrophic oceans are predominantly net autotrophic and acting as a CO₂ sink, or net
66 heterotrophic and therefore acting as a CO₂ source to the atmosphere (Duarte et al. 2013;
67 Williams et al. 2013). Consensus is constrained by measurement capabilities and by the
68 spatial and temporal frequency with which NCP can be determined (Ducklow and Doney
69 2013).

70 Over the past several decades, the carbon fixation and metabolic balance of the Global
71 Ocean has been largely derived from measurements of *in vitro* changes in cellular ¹⁴C and
72 dissolved O₂, respectively. These techniques rely on light-dark incubations to assess the
73 incorporation of ¹⁴C-labelled CO₂ into cells or production-consumption of O₂ over time and
74 typically over 24 h. For *in vitro* changes in dissolved O₂, the samples are placed in
75 borosilicate glass bottles and exposed to sunlight, either on-deck or on *in situ* floating buoys
76 (Robinson et al. 2009), and the measured changes in O₂ are attributed to biological processes.
77 The nature of these techniques means that ship borne measurements have limited spatial and
78 temporal coverage. Over the past decade, geochemical methods have been developed; these
79 are measurements of the O₂/Ar ratio and the triple isotopic composition of dissolved O₂ as a
80 natural tracer of GPP and NCP. These measurements have been made on both research and
81 commercial ships, such as ferries and container ships, to increase the spatial coverage of

82 sampling (Juraneck and Quay 2013). The approach is based on *in situ* O₂ mass balance
83 calculations, the triple oxygen isotope composition ($\delta(^{17}\text{O})$ and $\delta(^{18}\text{O})$) of dissolved O₂ and
84 the O₂/Ar concentration ratio, which allow for longer time scale integration and extrapolation
85 of measurements to dynamically changing conditions (Kaiser 2011). Though the number of
86 observations has increased, they describe the metabolic status over the mixed layer depth,
87 rather than at discrete depths. Whilst *in vitro* methods provide an estimate of NCP over short
88 time-scales (24 h), geochemical methods (O₂/Ar and the triple-oxygen-isotope method)
89 integrate over longer time-scales (typically 1 to 3 weeks). *In vitro* methods suffer from
90 potential substrate depletion and community changes and do not account for the effect of UV
91 radiation (Agusti et al. 2014; Regaudie-de-Gioux et al. 2014). Geochemical methods are
92 hampered by uncertainty over the parameterisation of O₂ exchange between the oceans and
93 atmosphere. These approaches may also underestimate NCP because they do not account for
94 O₂ photolysis (Kitidis et al. 2014). Neither of these approaches is able to fully resolve NCP at
95 the global or even basin scales.

96 The debate continues as to which measurements of NCP are more representative of the
97 metabolic state of the oceans (Duarte et al. 2013; Williams et al. 2013). From geochemical
98 O₂-based estimates of NCP and ¹³C enrichment of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) in
99 surface waters, Williams et al. (2013) argue that the oligotrophic subtropical gyres of the
100 open ocean are net autotrophic. They also suggest that lateral and vertical inputs of organic
101 carbon are insufficient to sustain net heterotrophy. They conclude that *in vitro* measurements
102 of changes in O₂ are erroneous in the oligotrophic gyres, which may be due to an
103 underestimate of GPP (rather than an overestimate of R), as bottle incubations should
104 represent a greater perturbation to natural light conditions for mixed-layer phytoplankton than
105 they do to respiratory conditions for heterotrophs. By contrast, Duarte et al. (2013) counter
106 argue that *in vitro* estimates of net heterotrophy in the oligotrophic gyres are correct because

107 scaling relationships indicate that heterotrophic communities prevail in areas of low GPP,
108 low chlorophyll *a* (Chl_a), and warm water, typical of the oligotrophic ocean. Heterotrophic
109 metabolism can prevail where metabolic activity is subsidized by organic carbon inputs from
110 the continental shelf or the atmosphere and from non-photosynthetic autotrophic and/or
111 mixotrophic metabolic pathways. Duarte et al. (2013) reject the hypothesis that *in situ*
112 measurements in oligotrophic regions indicate net autotrophy because both O₂/N₂ and O₂/Ar
113 based methods only integrate over the mixed layer rather than the euphotic depth thus
114 missing a substantial part of the plankton activity in the open ocean. These issues remain
115 unresolved and the debate on whether the open ocean is net autotrophic or net heterotrophic,
116 continues. Parallel to this, the oligotrophic regions are expanding (Polovina et al. 2008) due
117 to warming of the ocean, which could impact the metabolic balance of the Global Ocean.

118 There has been a concerted effort to derive both Net Primary Production (NPP) and GPP
119 from satellite ocean colour data, which has been driven by a series of model comparisons
120 (Campbell et al. 2002; Carr et al. 2006; Friedrichs et al. 2009; Saba et al. 2010; Tilstone et al.
121 2009). Algorithms to predict NCP however, are in their infancy. Recently, empirical
122 relationships between measured ¹⁴C POC and NCP have been used with satellite-based
123 estimates of POC production to estimate NCP in specific regions of the Atlantic Ocean
124 (Duarte et al. 2001; Serret et al. 2002; Serret et al. 2001), in the Southern Ocean (Nevison et
125 al. 2014; Chang et al. 2014) and at global scales (Westberry et al. 2012). Serret et al. (2009)
126 derived empirical relationships between measurements of *in vitro* O₂ based NCP and ¹⁴C
127 particulate organic carbon production (¹⁴C POC) to predict NCP in either eutrophic or
128 oligotrophic environments. Lopez-Urrutia et al. (2006) derived models to infer NCP from
129 temperature and the size structure of the plankton community. Empirical relationships
130 between R and a satellite based NPP model have been used to estimate global NCP
131 (Westberry et al. 2012). Satellite models of NCP, based on net primary production and

132 export, have also been proposed for the Southern Ocean (Nevison et al. 2012). Chang et al.
133 (2014) developed a neural network approach based on self-organizing maps to construct
134 weekly gridded maps of organic carbon export for the Southern Ocean. The maps were
135 trained with *in situ* measurements of O₂/Ar to estimate NCP linked to potential predictors of
136 NCP through statistical relationships with photosynthetically available radiation (PAR), Chla
137 and mixed layer depth (MLD).

138 The objective of this paper is to develop and validate empirical satellite algorithms of
139 NCP that can be applied to ocean colour satellite data, such as SeaWiFS and MODIS-Aqua,
140 for the Atlantic Ocean. Using the SeaWiFS archive, the most accurate algorithms were used
141 to analyse decadal trends in NCP, the extent of net heterotrophy in the Atlantic Ocean and the
142 effect of climate forcing indices on this metabolic balance in different biogeochemical
143 provinces.

144 **2. Materials and Methods**

145 *2.1. Study area and sampling regime.*

146 Water samples were collected from May 1990 to November 2011 using a SeaBird CTD on 26
147 cruises in the Atlantic Ocean, Mediterranean and Greenland Seas (Table 1). Sampling depths
148 were determined by *in situ* fluorescence (WetLabs fluorometer), temperature, salinity (SBE)
149 and / or PAR (Chelsea, SATLANTIC or Ocean Optics) profiles. Depth integrated *in vitro*
150 NCP measurements were collected from 295 stations (Fig. 1A; Table 1). Of these, 61 stations
151 from AMT 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 21 were used to calibrate the satellite algorithms (Fig. 2A,
152 B) and data from AMT 4, 5, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 21, other Atlantic Ocean cruises,
153 Greenland and Mediterranean Seas (N=234; Table 1) were used to validate the algorithms
154 (Fig. 3, 4, 5). Where calibration and validation data were used from the same cruises over
155 similar time and spatial scales, there was no significant correlation between these data

156 ($r=0.059$, $P=0.653$). Coincident *in vitro* NCP and ^{14}C POC were determined at 145 stations;
157 61 stations were used to calibrate new empirical algorithms of NCP, and 84 stations were
158 used for algorithm validation.

159 2.2 Measured parameters.

160 2.2.1. *In vitro* ^{14}C Particulate Organic Carbon Production (POC).

161 Measurements of ^{14}C POC ($N = 145$) were made on seven AMT cruises (AMT 12, 13, 14, 15,
162 16, 18, 21; [Table 1](#)). Water samples were taken from 6 to 8 depths based on percentage
163 surface irradiance and transferred from Niskin bottles to blacked-out carboys. Water from
164 each sample was sub sampled into three 75-ml clear polycarbonate bottles and three black
165 polycarbonate bottles. Each bottle was inoculated with between 185 and 740 kBq (5–20 mCi)
166 $\text{NaH}^{14}\text{CO}_3$ according to the biomass of phytoplankton. They were then transferred to an on-
167 deck, simulated *in situ* incubation system using neutral density and blue filters to reproduce
168 sub-surface irradiance. The bottles were maintained at *in situ* temperature by pumping either
169 sea surface water and / or refrigerated water through the system from dawn to sunset.
170 Suspended material was filtered through 0.2 μm polycarbonate filters. The production of ^{14}C
171 dissolved organic carbon (DOC) was not measured. ^{14}C POC measured at discrete depths was
172 integrated over the sampling depth to 1% irradiance over daylight hours only, which means
173 that integrated values are similar to NPP ([Marra 2009](#)). Further details of the protocols are
174 given in ([Poulton et al. 2006](#); [Tilstone et al. 2009](#)).

175 2.2.2. *In vitro* Net Community Production.

176 A dataset of NCP measurements was created from the database originally collated and
177 maintained for Robinson and Williams ([2005](#)), supplemented with recently published data
178 ([Regaudie-de-Gioux and Duarte 2010](#); [Regaudie-de-Gioux et al. 2009](#)) and measurements

179 made during recent AMT's (Table 1). The dataset is available at
180 [http://www.uea.ac.uk/environmental-](http://www.uea.ac.uk/environmental-sciences/people/People/Faculty+and+Research+Fellow/robinsonc#research)
181 [sciences/people/People/Faculty+and+Research+Fellow/robinsonc#research](http://www.uea.ac.uk/environmental-sciences/people/People/Faculty+and+Research+Fellow/robinsonc#research) and the AMT
182 data are available from the British Oceanographic Data Centre (BODC). In order to ensure
183 that the depth integrated data best approximates the NCP in the euphotic zone, data were only
184 used when more than three depths were sampled and when the shallowest depth was <15m
185 and the deepest was >50m. Photic zone integrated values were calculated by trapezoidal
186 integration of the volumetric data from the surface to the 1% light depth. The details of the
187 incubation and Winkler titration procedure used for each study are given in the cited
188 references in Table 1. Determination of NCP on the AMT cruises followed the procedures
189 described in Gist et al. (2009).

190 2.3. Satellite Estimates.

191 2.3.1. Satellite Algorithms of Net Community Production.

192 Four empirical relationships to derive NCP from *in vitro* ¹⁴C POC were used and validated
193 against independent *in vitro* O₂ NCP measurements. The first algorithm (Eq. 1) was derived
194 from AMT6 data from three productive provinces and two unproductive areas of the East
195 Atlantic, where net heterotrophy has been frequently measured. The second (Eq. 2) was
196 derived from AMT11 data, which includes three productive provinces and one unproductive
197 isolated regime in the South Atlantic, where net autotrophy prevailed (Serret et al. 2009). The
198 algorithms are as follows:

$$199 \quad NCP_A = 49.53 * \int \quad {}^{14}C \ POC^{0.48} - 300 \quad \text{Eq. 1 (AMT6 model).}$$

$$200 \quad NCP_B = 212.01 * \int \quad {}^{14}C \ POC^{0.15} - 300 \quad \text{Eq. 2 (AMT11 model).}$$

201 To derive the power law, a value of 300 was added to each NCP measurement to make all the
202 values positive. This value has then to be subtracted to derive the predicted NCP value in
203 $\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$.

204 For the third algorithm, half of the data from cruises AMT 12, 13, 14, 16, 18, 21
205 (N=61; referred to as calibration data) were used to derive a new empirical algorithm based
206 on the power law between measured *in vitro* NCP and ^{14}C POC (Fig. 2A). To make it
207 independent from the other algorithms, data from AMT6 and 11 were not included. For
208 illustrative purposes, some data from AMT6 are indicated as outliers in Fig. 3. The algorithm
209 is as follows:

$$210 \quad NCP_C = 163.83 * \int \quad ^{14}\text{C POC}^{0.2035} - 300 \quad \text{Eq. 3.}$$

211 Similarly using the same AMT calibration data (N=61), a fourth algorithm was derived from
212 the power law between measured *in vitro* O_2 NCP and ^{14}C POC & SST, as follows:

$$213 \quad NCP_D = a * \int \quad ^{14}\text{C POC}^{(b*SST-d)} - 300 \quad \text{Eq. 4.}$$

214 where $a = 179.86$, $b = -0.0036$ and $d = -0.2487$ and POC is in $\text{mg C m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$ and SST in $^\circ\text{C}$.
215 The relationship between NCP and SST is given in Fig. 2B.

216 The performance of the four NCP algorithms ($NCP_{A,B,C,D}$) was assessed in four ways:
217 firstly using 84 measurements of *in vitro* ^{14}C POC and SST from AMT 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18,
218 21 to model NCP (hereafter validation data Table 1), which were compared with *in vitro* NCP
219 (Fig. 3, Table 2); secondly using satellite POC production generated from SeaWiFS OC4v6
220 Chla and AVHRR SST to calculate satellite NCP, which were compared with *in vitro* NCP
221 (Fig. 4, Table 2) using the validation data listed in Table 1 (N = 234); thirdly using POC
222 production generated from MODIS-Aqua OC3M and AVHRR SST to calculate satellite NCP
223 which was then compared with *in vitro* NCP (Fig. 4, Table 2); and fourthly using mean

224 monthly SeaWiFS data to derive NCP_C and NCP_D which were compared with mean monthly
 225 measured *in vitro* NCP using the validation data given in Table 1 (Fig. 5, 6, 7).

226 2.3.2. Satellite maps of Net Community Production.

227 Mean monthly satellite maps of NCP for the most accurate algorithm(s) were generated using
 228 NASA 9 km SeaWiFS OC4v6 Chla R2010 from 1998 to 2010. NCP was calculated from
 229 monthly satellite fields of POC production using the wavelength resolving model (WRM) of
 230 Morel (1991) implemented following Smyth et al. (2005) with SeaWiFS OC4v6 Chla and
 231 AVHRR SST data as follows:

$$232 \quad \sum POC\text{production} = 12 a_{\max}^* \phi_m \int_0^D \int_0^{z_{eq}} \int_0^{700} Chla(z) PUR(z, t, \lambda) f(x(z, t)) d\lambda dz dt \text{ Eq 5.}$$

233 where a_{\max}^* is the absorption cross section per unit of Chla, ϕ_m is the net growth rate in mol C
 234 (mol quanta)⁻¹ and PUR is the phytoplankton useable radiance. The WRM was calibrated
 235 using depth profiles such that surface values are a proxy for depth resolution to 1% of surface
 236 irradiance. The results from the WRM of Morel (1991) are equivalent to ¹⁴C POC (Tilstone et
 237 al. 2009). Further details of how this WRM was run are given in Smyth et al. (2005). NCP
 238 was then calculated using the WRM POC production with SeaWiFS or MODIS-Aqua data
 239 using equation 3, and additionally with AVHRR or MODIS-Aqua SST data using equation 4.

240 2.4. Climate Indices.

241 Climatic indices are indicative of large-scale variability in physical parameters in the ocean.
 242 Trends in satellite estimates of NCP were compared with trends in the following climate
 243 indices: North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) monthly indices were taken from
 244 www.cgd.ucar.edu/cas/; the multivariate ENSO index (MEI), which is representative of
 245 ENSO phases (Wolter and Timlin 2011), was downloaded from NOAA at

246 www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/enso/mei/; Northern Hemisphere Temperature (NHT), the weighted
247 average of all grid-box measurements to derive SST and atmospheric anomalies (Jones et al.
248 2012), were obtained from the Climatic Research Unit, University of East Anglia and the Met
249 Office Hadley Centre.

250 2.5. Statistical analyses.

251 Measured *in vitro* NCP within ± 3 hours of satellite overpass were used as the mean of a 1
252 km 3 x 3 pixel array around the sampling station following the procedures outlined in Bailey
253 and Werdell (2006). Measured *in vitro* and satellite NCP were compared using model II
254 linear regression analysis and the slope, intercept and percentage variability explained (r^2).
255 The following statistics were used to evaluate model performance: the mean (M) and standard
256 deviation (S) of the \log_{10} -difference error between measured *in vitro* and satellite or *in vitro*
257 estimated NCP at each station and the \log_{10} root-mean square (\log_{10} -RMS). We also used the
258 inverse \log_{10} transformed difference between satellite and measured values of M (F_{med}), $M-S$
259 (F_{min}) and $M+S$ (F_{max}) following (Campbell et al. 2002). To be able to \log_{10} transform
260 negative NCP values, which indicate net heterotrophy, the lowest NCP value (-215 mmol O_2
261 $\text{m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) was added to the entire data set. The F_{med} , F_{min} and F_{max} values therefore indicate
262 relative rather than absolute differences. The unbiased (UPD) and absolute (APD) percentage
263 difference were calculated to illustrate the uncertainty between measured *in vitro* and satellite
264 NCP. The distribution of NCP was transformed until no significant difference was found
265 between the expected and the observed distributions using the Kolmogorov - Smirnov with
266 Lilliefors test to ensure homoscedasticity (Sokal and Rolf 1997). One way analysis of
267 variance (ANOVA) was used to test whether there were significant differences between
268 measured *in vitro* and satellite NCP. The ANOVA results are given as $F_{1,df} = x, p = y$ where F
269 is the mean square to mean square error ratio, the sub-script numbers denote the degrees of
270 freedom and p is the ANOVA critical significance value.

271 Mean monthly satellite NCP were extracted from 9 km maps in the following provinces,
272 corresponding to the main regions from which the *in vitro* data were collected: North Atlantic
273 Drift Province (NADR), North Atlantic Tropical Gyre (NATL), Canary Current Coastal
274 upwelling (CNRY), Western Tropical Atlantic (WTRA), Eastern Tropical Atlantic (ETRA),
275 South Atlantic Subtropical Gyre (SATL), Benguela Current Coastal (BENG) and South
276 Subtropical Convergence (SSTC). The relationships between satellite NCP and climate
277 indices were evaluated in three ways: 1.) Pearson correlation coefficients between mean
278 monthly anomalies, 2.) Pearson correlation coefficients between mean annual values, and 3.)
279 analysis of trends in cumulative sums of the monthly anomalies. For the first and latter
280 analyses, mean monthly NCP anomalies were calculated by subtracting from each monthly
281 value, the corresponding monthly average for the time series from 1998 to 2010. The
282 correlations were run on anomalies so that temporal autocorrelation was reduced, since
283 autocorrelation in the dataset may complicate statistical interpretation. For the correlation
284 analyses, to further reduce any potential temporal autocorrelation between biological and
285 physical data we also implemented the method of Pyper and Peterman (1998). This approach
286 re-calculates the probability of significance of the correlation based on adjusted degrees of
287 freedom to correct for temporal autocorrelation. This method was originally designed to
288 account for temporal autocorrelation between fish and environmental data (Tzanatos et al.
289 2014), and is therefore ideal for analysing relationships between phytoplankton and climate
290 variables.

291 The cumulative sums method was applied to the anomalies to further decompose the
292 signal by reducing the high frequency variability to highlight major changes in monthly data
293 values along the time-series (McQuatters-Gollop et al. 2008). Successive positive anomalies
294 produce an increasing slope, whereas successive negative anomalies produce a decreasing

295 slope. The area-averaged monthly cumulative sum of NCP was compared against the
296 cumulative sum of each of the climate indices given in Section 2.4.

297 **3. Results**

298 *3.1. Distribution of in vitro measurements of NCP.*

299 The NCP measurements indicated predominantly positive NCP (i.e. $GPP > R$) in the
300 NADR (N=79) and CNRY (N=6) during both boreal spring and autumn, though there were
301 few measurements available in the CNRY (Fig. 1). Considering the high standard deviation
302 in measured NCP, the NATL (N=99) tended to be in net balance in both boreal spring (mean
303 $NCP 17 \pm 85 \text{ mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) and autumn (mean $NCP -29 \pm 92 \text{ mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$). The
304 standard deviation was high because the area of the NATL is large (290789 km^2), and
305 different locations at different times of each year were sampled. During boreal autumn in the
306 WTRA, some data indicated that $GPP > R$ whilst others indicated $R > GPP$ (Fig. 1C), and the
307 mean NCP was $-24 \pm 106 \text{ mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$ (N=29), similarly suggesting net balance. The
308 SATL (N=48) also exhibited net balance in both austral autumn (mean $NCP -32 \pm 73 \text{ mmol}$
309 $\text{O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) and winter (mean $NCP 0 \pm 65 \text{ mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$), considering the magnitude of the
310 standard deviation. NCP data were only available in austral spring in the SSTC (N=11) and
311 the mean was $79 \pm 62 \text{ mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$, which is indicative of net autotrophy. There were too
312 few measurements for a comprehensive evaluation of the metabolic status of this province.
313 There were no measurements to evaluate the metabolic status of the ETRA and BENG. The
314 other *in vitro* NCP data were from the North Atlantic (N=3), Antarctic (N=4), the Greenland
315 (N=8) and Mediterranean (N=8) Seas (Table 1), but of these, there were also too few to
316 assess the metabolic status of these regions.

317 *3.2. Validation of satellite algorithms of NCP in the Atlantic Ocean.*

318 NCP_D had the lowest M , S , RMS-E and \log_{10} -RMS, the highest r^2 (except using MODIS-
319 Aqua) and F_{med} closest to 1 using both the measured and satellite POC production and SST
320 data (Fig. 3D, 4D, Table 2). There was no significant difference between measured and
321 modelled NCP_D estimated from measurements of ¹⁴C POC and SST ($F_{1,167}=1.34$, $p=0.249$;
322 Fig. 3D) and satellite POC production for both SeaWiFS ($F_{1,25}=0.38$, $P=0.544$) and MODIS-
323 Aqua ($F_{1,35}=0.01$, $P=0.905$; Fig. 4D). The UPD and APD for NCP_D against *in vitro*
324 measurements, using both measured ¹⁴C POC and SST or satellite data, yielded the lowest
325 difference of all of the algorithms tested, though APD of NCP_C for SeaWiFS was similar.
326 NCP_C exhibited a similar accuracy, with low M , S , RMS-E, \log_{10} -RMS, UPD, APD and
327 intercept, and F_{med} close to 1 using both measured and satellite data (Fig. 3C, 4C, Table 2).
328 For NCP_C there was similarly no significant difference between NCP_C estimated from
329 measurements of ¹⁴C POC production and SST ($F_{1,167}=0.34$, $P=0.559$) and satellite derived
330 POC production for both SeaWiFS ($F_{1,25}=0.08$, $P=0.785$) and MODIS-Aqua ($F_{1,35}=0.51$,
331 $p=0.478$). For the mean monthly time series (Fig. 5), NCP_D was closer than NCP_C to the
332 mean monthly measured NCP (Fig. 6, 7). In the NATL, the absolute percentage difference
333 between measured *in vitro* values and NCP_C was 45 %, whereas for NCP_D it was 29 %. In the
334 WTRA, the difference was 62 % for NCP_C and 27 % for NCP_D, and in the SATL it was 20 %
335 for NCP_C and 17 % for NCP_D. NCP estimates using NCP_D were significantly higher in the
336 NADR, CNRY, BENG and SSTC ($P<0.0001$); NCP_C were significantly higher in the NATL,
337 ETRA, WTRA and SATL ($P<0.0001$; Fig. 5).

338 NCP_A generally had the highest M , S , RMS-E, \log_{10} -RMS and intercept, indicating a
339 significant bias with a tendency to under-estimate NCP, as illustrated by the high F_{med} and
340 F_{max} values. Using the independent dataset of ¹⁴C POC measurements to validate the
341 algorithm, there was a tendency for NCP_A to under-estimate NCP across the entire range of
342 values, though the slope was parallel to the 1:1 (Fig. 3A). Using SeaWiFS and MODIS-Aqua

343 data, the slope was between 1.5 and 2.0, and the UPD and APD were between 6 and 15% of
344 measured values (Fig. 4A). There was a significant difference between measured *in vitro*
345 NCP and NCP_A run using both measured ¹⁴C POC and SST ($F_{1,167}=61.40$, $P<0.0001$) and
346 satellite data from SeaWiFS ($F_{1,25}=11.18$, $P=0.003$) and MODIS-Aqua ($F_{1,35}=12.68$, $P=0.001$;
347 Table 2). NCP_B generally improved the accuracy using both measured and satellite ¹⁴C POC
348 and SST (Fig. 3B, 4B, Table 2), though there were still significant differences between
349 estimates derived from measured ($F_{1,167}=16.56$, $P<0.0001$) and MODIS-Aqua ($F_{1,35}=16.17$,
350 $P<0.0001$). For SeaWiFS there was no significant difference between measured *in vitro* and
351 satellite derived NCP_B ($F_{1,25}=3.85$, $P=0.061$; Fig. 4B), though this was just above the 5 %
352 level of significance.

353

354 4. Discussion

355 4.1. Validation of satellite algorithms of net community production.

356 Remote sensing observations offer an attractive means of providing NCP data at a higher
357 temporal and spatial resolution that can be achieved by *in vitro* and *in situ* observations, as
358 long as accurate algorithms can be developed. The premise for using remote sensing data is
359 that no area of the ocean is likely to be permanently autotrophic or heterotrophic, so it is
360 necessary to have data at a high resolution to be able to adequately assess instances of net
361 autotrophy or heterotrophy to accurately budget the metabolic state of specific provinces or
362 regions. To this end, Westberry et al. (2012) converted satellite-derived NPP to O₂
363 equivalents using a photosynthetic quotient (PQ) of 1.4 or 1.1, depending on the primary
364 nitrogen source for a given phytoplankton community following (Laws 1991). They applied
365 empirical Photosynthesis-Respiration relationships to depth-resolved output from the Carbon
366 based Production Model (CbPM) and then vertically integrated over the water column to

367 yield euphotic-zone areal rates of GPP, R and NCP. For the Bermuda Atlantic Time Series
368 site (BATS), Westberry et al. (2014) reported NCP of between 24 and 26 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹ for
369 May, July, September and October. Similarly, our NCP_C algorithm yielded estimates of 23
370 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹ over the SeaWiFS time series for these months, though values from NCP_D
371 were lower (11 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹). Chang et al. (2014), using a neural network approach,
372 reported mean area-integrated NCP south of 50 °S in the Southern Ocean of 18 mmol C m⁻² d⁻¹
373 ¹. For the SSTC region, they reported >30 mmol C m⁻² d⁻¹, which is similar to our estimate of
374 33 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹ using NCP_C (assuming PQ=1.1), though this was double using NCP_D
375 (which may account for higher PQ values).

376 We also compared the empirical solutions of NCP proposed by Serret et al. (2009) with
377 these new algorithms (NCP_C and NCP_D) derived from a database comprised of *in vitro* O₂
378 NCP measurements in the Atlantic Ocean, Greenland and Mediterranean Seas. The rationale
379 for using a power law is that at negative *in vitro* NCP values, a small increment in ¹⁴C POC
380 correlates with a large linear rise in NCP (Fig. 2A), which is controlled by both nutrient
381 limitation, bacterial production and grazing. Beyond zero NCP, large increments in ¹⁴C POC
382 correlate with smaller increments in NCP (Fig. 2A) as the fixation of CO₂ reaches capacity
383 under replete, nutrient conditions and high phytoplankton growth. The power law for the
384 AMT6 model given in Serret et al. (2009) is constrained to the lower end of the range shown
385 in Fig. 2A and the AMT11 model, to the upper end of the range. The slope of the AMT6
386 model (0.48), was higher than that of the AMT11 model (0.15) (Serret et al. 2009). The lower
387 slope in the AMT11 model indicates that even though ¹⁴C POC increases, there is no parallel
388 increase in NCP, which suggests that R increases more than GPP in the AMT6 model. In the
389 AM6 model ¹⁴C POC and R are more tightly coupled. In both models, at negative NCP there
390 is less coupling between ¹⁴C POC and R, which implies that allochthonous organic matter

391 subsidies are necessary at low ^{14}C POC. These subsidies are of minor importance at high ^{14}C
392 POC.

393 We tested each of these relationships separately using an independent dataset to assess
394 which of the algorithms best describes the spatial and temporal variability in NCP in the
395 Atlantic Ocean. Though contrasting provinces may have different relationships between ^{14}C
396 POC and NCP, the premise for this is that the relationship that best fits the *in vitro*
397 measurements has the capacity to capture salient trends in metabolic state in the Atlantic
398 Ocean. Of the *in vitro* measurements used for validation (N=234), ~54 % were collected from
399 the oligotrophic gyres and ~80 % were collected during boreal autumn-winter. Due to the
400 distribution of the data, theoretically, the relationship derived for the AMT6 model should be
401 more accurate. The results of the algorithm validation however, indicated that the relationship
402 derived for the AMT11 model consistently had a smaller bias and random error, a lower
403 intercept RMS-E and \log_{10} -RMS and based on F_{med} (and F_{max}) was closer to 1, indicating
404 more accurate estimates of NCP at median values where the majority of the data fell (Fig. 3).
405 Using data from individual cruises to calibrate empirical algorithms can result in a strong
406 bias, which limits their applicability in space and time, which proved to be the case for the
407 AMT6 and 11 models. We therefore used a more comprehensive data set from the Atlantic
408 Ocean to calibrate a further empirical algorithm for the basin (NCP_C ; eq. 3). This was based
409 on the same power law between ^{14}C POC and NCP (Fig. 2) as in Serret et al. (2009), but
410 using different data and without differentiating between trophic or geographic regions. This
411 improved the bias at the minimum and maximum range of the *in vitro* NCP measurements,
412 but there was still an offset (Fig. 3C). We were able to reduce this offset further by
413 introducing SST in the power law between ^{14}C POC and NCP (NCP_D ; eq. 4) which in turn,
414 improved each validation statistic metric (Fig. 3D, Table 2). The accuracy of the algorithms
415 compared with the *in vitro* measurements was $\text{NCP}_D > \text{NCP}_C > \text{NCP}_A > \text{NCP}_B$. NCP_D was

416 consistently more accurate than the other algorithms at low (negative NCP), high (positive
417 NCP) and median (net balance) values (Fig. 3D, 4D, Table 2).

418 The temperature-size rule predicts that phytoplankton become smaller in a warmer,
419 ocean (Finkel et al. 2010; Morán et al. 2010), at a rate of 2.5% decrease in cell volume per
420 1 °C (Atkinson et al. 2003). Seawater temperature is a driver of plankton community
421 metabolism (Regaudie-de-Gioux and Duarte 2012). Lopez-Urrutia et al. (2006) showed that
422 the balance between plankton production and respiration is affected by environmental
423 temperature and that a differential response to temperature at the organism level determines
424 the metabolic balance. In the sub-tropical North and South Atlantic, the activation energy that
425 describes the temperature dependence of planktonic community metabolism is higher for R
426 than for GPP (García-Corral et al. 2014). The real challenge in estimating NCP from satellite
427 is to derive a robust proxy for R, which also exhibits an exponential temperature dependence
428 at both subcellular and individual species levels (Gillooly et al. 2001). This suggests that the
429 accuracy of NCP_D over the other algorithms is due to the fact that it captures more of the
430 temperature dependency of GPP and R. Variability in the temperature dependence of R can
431 be driven by a range of mechanisms that are contingent on temporal and spatial scales
432 (Perkins et al. 2012). As long as sufficient data are used to capture these spatial and temporal
433 changes, robust relationships between GPP and SST can be used to characterise the variation
434 in GPP, R and thus NCP as we have shown here (Figs. 3, 4, Table 2). Since some of the data
435 used were from the Antarctic, Greenland and Mediterranean Seas, these relationships may
436 also be applicable to these regions and further validation data is needed to assess their
437 applicability in these regions.

438 When the algorithms were applied to satellite POC production using the WRM, there
439 was a consistent improvement in NCP_C with SeaWiFS data, such that the slope F_{med} , F_{min} and
440 F_{max} were near to 1, the APD was high and the intercept small (Table 2, Fig. 4C). By

441 comparison, NCP_D was more accurate with MODIS-Aqua than with SeaWiFS (Table 2, Fig.
442 4D). This bias between ocean colour sensors is not likely to be due to differences in sensor
443 characteristics. There is good agreement between normalised water leaving radiance, the
444 primary input to derive Chla, from both SeaWiFS and MODIS-Aqua which were within 0 to -
445 2 and 1 to 7 % relative percentage difference from *in situ* values both at open ocean (Zibordi
446 et al. 2006) and coastal sites (Melin et al. 2007). The number of match-ups for SeaWiFS and
447 MODIS-Aqua were similar in the NATL, SATL and WTRA. The differences between
448 algorithms applied to both SeaWiFS and MODIS-Aqua was probably because the match-ups
449 with MODIS-Aqua covered a greater range of NCP than with SeaWiFS (Fig. 4), and over this
450 range, NCP_D is potentially more accurate (Fig. 3). In addition, for MODIS-Aqua there were
451 more match-up data from autumn in the NADR and NATL than for SeaWiFS. At these times
452 of the year, in these provinces, and based on Fig. 4, we would expect NCP_D to perform better
453 than NCP_C . For SeaWiFS, there were also more match-ups in the upwelling and eutrophic
454 regions of the CNRY and NADR. Similarly, there were more SeaWiFS match-ups in spring
455 in the NADR and NATL, when these provinces are net autotrophic. Since NCP_C was derived
456 from the power law between ^{14}C POC alone and for the SeaWiFS match-ups predominantly
457 $GPP > R$, which accounts for an improvement in the accuracy NCP_C with SeaWiFS data. By
458 comparison, NCP_D reduced the scatter from *in vitro* measurements in the WTRA that the
459 approach of Westberry et al. (2012) found challenging. We had no match-up data for the
460 BENG, ETRA and SSTC, so we were not able to evaluate the performance of these
461 algorithms in these provinces. Regional algorithms for the Atlantic Ocean may be more
462 accurate than basin or global scale approaches (Serret et al. 2009). Though we collated a
463 comprehensive data set of *in vitro* measurements for the Atlantic Ocean, 36 % of the data
464 were from the NATL and 29 % from the NADR, in autumn (Fig. 1). Any regional differences
465 in the relationships between GPP and R and NCP and ^{14}C POC are therefore likely to arise

466 from differences in sampling times in the North and South Atlantic rather than differences
467 between provinces per se. Future campaigns should aim to collect further data for satellite
468 model validation in boreal spring-summer and austral autumn-winter, especially in South
469 Atlantic provinces.

470

471 4.2. Metabolic state of the Atlantic Ocean.

472 Controversy still exists over whether the oligotrophic gyres in the global oceans are net
473 autotrophic or heterotrophic. On the one hand, *in vitro* measurements of NCP over-
474 whelmingly imply that the oligotrophic subtropical gyres of the open ocean are net
475 heterotrophic or in net balance (Duarte et al. 1998; Duarte et al. 2001). Williams et al. (2013)
476 looked at the possible sources of organic carbon and calculated that none of them were high
477 enough to support net heterotrophy. From trends in *in situ* geochemical methods, Williams et
478 al. (2013) deduced that the oligotrophic gyres are net autotrophic. Westberry et al. (2012)
479 used satellite ocean colour estimates of NCP, reported a range from 630 to 2,800 Tmol C a⁻¹
480 and from these observations, they estimated that 57 % of the global ocean surface area was
481 net heterotrophic.

482 By way of comparison to these studies, we generated mean annual NCP images from the
483 two most accurate algorithms (NCP_D and NCP_C) for the Atlantic Ocean using SeaWiFS data
484 from 1998 to 2010 (Fig. 5) and the corresponding mean monthly time series data for eight
485 Atlantic Provinces (Fig. 6, 7). NCP_C indicated that annually, GPP>R in all provinces, but that
486 in NADR, NATL, SATL and SSTC there were periods when R>GPP. For NCP_C, the CNRY
487 had the highest (mean $\sim 121 \pm 18$ mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹) and the SATL had the lowest values ($10 \pm$
488 6 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹; Table 3). By comparison, for NCP_D, GPP>R in all provinces and there
489 were periods in the NATL, SATL and WTRA when mean monthly values were just below 0
490 mmol O₂ m⁻² d⁻¹, indicating net heterotrophy (Fig. 7). In the NATL during boreal autumn and

491 in the SATL during austral autumn and winter, mean values were negative, but the standard
492 deviation was greater than the negative NCP during austral and boreal autumn indicating net
493 balance during these seasons (Table 3). Mean NCP_D for boreal spring, summer, autumn and
494 winter from 1998 to 2010 in the Atlantic Ocean are given in Fig. 8 and indicate the seasonal
495 extent of net autotrophy and net heterotrophy in the Atlantic Ocean. During boreal spring and
496 summer the extent of negative NCP values in the NATL was low (Fig. 8). This increased to
497 ~60 % by boreal autumn and winter (Fig. 9). Similarly during austral autumn and winter in
498 the SATL, the spatial extent of negative NCP was larger (up to 70 % of pixels) than during
499 austral spring and summer. In the WTRA during winter, there were 20 % negative NCP in
500 boreal spring and winter, which extended towards the African coast, whereas during spring,
501 summer and autumn this region was clearly net autotrophic (Fig. 8). Over the entire Atlantic
502 Ocean basin from NADR to SSTC, 27 % of pixels had negative NCP (Fig. 9). For the
503 Atlantic basin therefore, the contribution to net heterotrophy was principally due to the
504 seasonal oscillation between the NATL in boreal autumn-winter as previously observed by
505 Gist et al. (2009), and the SATL in austral autumn-winter (Fig. 9) also observed by González
506 et al. (2002). When mean monthly values of NCP were used to derive seasonal estimates of
507 NCP for individual provinces, net heterotrophy was only evident during boreal autumn-
508 winter in the NATL and during austral autumn-winter in the SATL (Table 3). There was
509 however considerable intra-regional variation as illustrated by the minimum and maximum
510 range in Fig. 5 & 6. This variation illustrates that there are areas of the NATL and SATL that
511 remain net heterotrophic for longer periods.

512 One of the key issues surrounding the existence and prevalence of net heterotrophy is
513 whether there is any error or bias in *in vitro* bottle incubations over the 24 h incubation period
514 (Williams et al. 2013). It has been argued that respiration rates measured from *in vitro* 'dark
515 bottle' incubations in the oligotrophic gyres are fuelled by production that occurred *in situ*,

516 under natural conditions, which is representative of very recent past conditions in these
517 tightly coupled ecosystems. In contrast, the photosynthetic rate derived from ‘light bottle’
518 incubations reflects production on the day of the incubation maintained in a static and
519 confined (bottle) environment, which can be very different from ambient *in situ* rates
520 (Westberry et al. 2012). In addition, there may be a bias in these measurements since
521 borosilicate bottles are opaque to UV radiation which can reduce NCP by 45 % (Agustí et al.
522 2014; Regaudie-de-Gioux et al. 2014).

523 To resolve this issue, Westberry et al. (2012) assumed that *in vitro* measurements
524 between 10 to 40° N and -10 to -40° S were erroneous as they arise from bottle artefacts and
525 therefore eliminated them from deriving any subsequent relationships for application to
526 satellite data. They then inferred that the resulting relationships are in agreement with
527 geochemical methods, which indicate net autotrophy globally. This is not surprising, because
528 if it is assumed that all *in vitro* measurements from the oligotrophic gyres (that exhibit net
529 heterotrophy) are erroneous, it is logical that the resulting GPP : R relationships will indicate
530 net autotrophy in the global ocean. We chose not to make any assumptions on the debate
531 between net autotrophy or heterotrophy in the oligotrophic gyres or pre-select the data used to
532 constrain the relationships between ¹⁴C POC and NCP (Fig. 1). The *in vitro* data from the
533 NATL (between 10-40°N) represented 36 % of the database and negative *in vitro* values, only
534 recorded during boreal autumn (Fig. 1C), were 5 % of the total database. Some areas of the
535 NATL are not strictly oligotrophic, however. Using data from AMT12-AMT21, when the
536 DCM and thermocline were >100 m, 83 % of data in the NATL were negative (mean NCP -
537 $12.40 \pm 2.95 \text{ mmolO}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$; Fig. 1).

538 The dilemma of whether to include these data or not is illustrated by the choice of
539 selecting either algorithm NCP_A or NCP_B. When NCP_A is used (representative of net
540 heterotrophy), it tends to under-estimate NCP (Fig. 4, 5). This resulted in 90 % of the

541 resulting NCP satellite estimates using MODIS-Aqua to be net heterotrophic and 65 % using
542 SeaWiFS. When NCP_B is used (representative of net autotrophy), only 3 and 6 % of MODIS-
543 Aqua and SeaWiFS match-ups were net heterotrophic since this algorithm tends to slightly
544 over-estimate NCP. Both NCP_C and NCP_D constrain the NCP estimates closer to the 1:1 and
545 the net result is that 55 and 35 % of the predicted values are net heterotrophic, using MODIS-
546 Aqua and SeaWiFS respectively.

547

548 4.3. Variation in NCP in the Atlantic Ocean in relation to climate indices.

549 Our objective was also to assess whether climate indices are correlated with phases of net
550 autotrophy and heterotrophy. Satellite estimates of NPP have already been used to detect
551 climate-induced responses in the marine biological carbon pump (Behrenfeld et al. 2006). A
552 decrease in global NPP from 1998 to 2006 was coupled with an increase in global SST as a
553 result of consecutive positive ENSO phases. These positive phases are associated with
554 warmer SST, increased stratification, and a deeper nutricline (Martinez et al. 2009). During
555 successive *El Niño* years (strong positive MEI), a deeper pycnocline in the eastern equatorial
556 Pacific results in a diminished supply of nutrients to surface waters and a paralleled decrease
557 in phytoplankton biomass (Pennington et al. 2006). For *La Niña* years (persistent negative
558 MEI), phytoplankton biomass increases across the whole equatorial Pacific, due to a shoaling
559 of the nutricline closer to the euphotic zone (Behrenfeld et al. 2006).

560 In our data, the trend in cumulative sums in NCP_D in the NADR was a net increase from
561 1998 to 2005, followed by a decrease from 2005 to 2008, then an increase again from 2008 to
562 2010 (Fig. 10A). In the NATL there was a net increase in the cumulative sums of NCP_D from
563 1998 to 2002, after which there was no change until 2006, when there was a decrease until
564 2010 (Fig. 10B). In the CNRY, there was a sharp rise in the cumulative sums of NCP from
565 1998 to 1999, which was followed by a gradual decrease until 2006, and an increase from

566 2006 to 2009 (Fig. 10C). The ETRA and WTRA exhibited a similar pattern from 1999 to
567 2010, with an increase in the cumulative sums of NCP_D from 1999 to 2005, followed by a
568 decrease from 2005 to 2010 (Fig. 10D, E). In the SATL, BENG and SSTC, there was a
569 gradual decrease in NCP_D from 1998 to 2009, followed by a sharp increase to 2010 (Fig. 10
570 F, G, H). These trends were largely reflected in the mean annual values (Fig. 10 I-P).
571 Analysing both mean monthly anomalies and mean annual values of NCP_D against a range of
572 climate indices, the most significant and consistent relationships were negative correlations
573 with MEI in the SATL and NAO in the SSTC, which explained 60 and 91 % of the annual
574 variability in NCP_D (Table 4; Fig. 10G, H). The cumulative sums of mean monthly anomalies
575 further emphasise these trends; positive MEI coincided with decreasing cumulative sums in
576 NCP_D and negative MEI coincided with an increase in NCP_D in the SATL (Fig. 10F, N). This
577 implies that the magnitude of net heterotrophy during austral autumn and winter in this region
578 could increase during successive positive MEI years. Statistical significance does not
579 necessarily mean causality and therefore we do not demonstrate the mechanism behind these
580 relationships. The scope of this analysis is not to provide a mechanistic link behind these
581 relationships, but to gain further confidence that our modelled NCP_D product is related to the
582 broader climate variability.

583 For MEI during *El Niño* conditions for example, a warming in the mid- and east-Pacific
584 causes convection to shift eastwards which weakens the convective circulation and reduces
585 upwelling in the Eastern Pacific Ocean through a relaxation of the thermocline and warming
586 of surface waters (Boyce et al. 2010). In the South Atlantic, this phenomenon has been linked
587 to warmer temperatures (Ineson and Scaife 2009), which could enhance stratification and
588 thus decrease NCP, which may explain the significant negative relationship we observed
589 between NCP and MEI in the SATL. Using empirical orthogonal function analysis and k-
590 means classification, Park et al. (2010) found that the periodicity in surface Chla was related

591 to *El Niño* events. The ENSO phenomenon is also known to cause climate variability on
592 inter-annual and decadal time-scales in the North Atlantic Ocean (Lau and Nath 2001).
593 ENSO is usually correlated with variability in SST and salinity or water column stratification
594 in the North Atlantic through changes in the wind-forcing (westerly and trade wind
595 variability), as well as in oceanic circulation patterns (e.g., latitudinal or longitudinal
596 displacements of Gulf, Azores or Canary Currents) (Curry and McCartney 2001). These
597 processes can in turn cause anomalies in the temperature and salinity fields (Cianca et al.
598 2012). Recently it has been shown that MEI is significantly and positively correlated with
599 Coccolithophore blooms in the North Atlantic (Shutler et al. 2012). During one of the
600 strongest positive MEI (*El Niño*) events in 1998, the subarctic North Atlantic experienced
601 unprecedentedly high sea-surface temperatures coinciding with the largest Coccolithophore
602 bloom observed during the satellite era (Raitos et al. 2006). ENSO has the potential to
603 reduce the North Atlantic net sink of CO₂ by between 3–28 % by affecting the coverage of *E.*
604 *huxleyi* (Shutler et al. 2012). By contrast to these studies, we did not find a significant
605 correlation between NCP_D and MEI in North Atlantic Provinces. Although the values given
606 in Table 4 are statistically significant (p<0.05), NCP_D and NAO in the WTRA and NHT in
607 the SSTC are at the limit of significance. These relationships should therefore be treated with
608 caution. The significant negative correlation that we observed between the MEI and NCP_D in
609 the SATL suggests that in this region, persistent positive MEI may lead to enhanced
610 stratification, lower nutrient availability and a reduction in NCP.

611 Over the past 30 years, there have been major fluctuations in atmospheric forcing in the
612 North Atlantic which is reflected in the NAO (Hakkinen and Rhines 2004). A large positive
613 NAO index is usually associated with strong westerly winds and low pressure around Iceland
614 (Hurrell and Deser 2009). Bentsen et al. (2004) observed that convective mixing in the North
615 Atlantic is linked to the NAO such that negative NAO leads to deeper vertical mixing in this

616 region. The traditional view is that this will enhance the supply of nutrients to the photic zone
617 for the onset of the spring bloom, which in turn affects the magnitude of GPP and possibly
618 also NCP. Significant changes in the North East Atlantic have been documented across
619 various trophic levels (Beaugrand et al. 2008; Edwards and Richardson 2004), which are
620 strongly associated with different phases of the NAO index (Henson et al. 2009; Henson et al.
621 2012). During positive NAO years in the central North Atlantic, vertical mixing induced by
622 strong westerly winds deepens the mixed layer. In the sub-Arctic and northern North Atlantic
623 positive NAO years enhances the southerly transport of cold and fresh Arctic water which
624 promotes strong stratification and a shoaling of the mixed layer (Zhai et al. 2012). Martinez et
625 al. (2009) reported that although regions that have opposite patterns in Chla and SST account
626 for 60 % of the global ocean, the North East Atlantic Ocean is characterized as an area of
627 increasing SST and high phytoplankton abundance. This is because oceanic warming at
628 higher North Atlantic temperate and Polar Regions contribute to reduce mixing, which may
629 lead to increased phytoplankton growth due to accumulation of phytoplankton in the higher
630 light environment of the surface ocean (Doney 2010; Richardson and Schoeman 2004). From
631 the mean monthly anomalies in NCP_D and NAO we did not observe significant correlations
632 in the NADR and NATL, though there was a strong positive correlations between mean
633 annual NCP_D and NAO further south in the CNRY and WTRA. There were also significant,
634 but negative correlations with NAO in the SSTC (Table 4B). The effect of the NAO on NCP
635 in the South Atlantic, to our knowledge, has not previously been documented thus the
636 mechanism for this is not understood.

637 In addition, we found significant negative correlations with NCP_D and NHT in the
638 ETRA and a positive correlation in the SSTC. Li et al. (2012) showed that the NAO is a good
639 predictor of NHT and that NAO precedes multi-decadal variability in NHT due to the thermal
640 inertia associated with the relatively slow oceanic processes of the North Atlantic. Ocean

641 colour anomalies of the NE Atlantic significantly parallel the NHT oscillation (Raitsos et al.
642 2014). The trend was reversed in the tropical Atlantic, because rising NHT causes thermal
643 stratification to increase, which reduces vertical mixing and thus nutrient availability in the
644 tropics (Doney 2006).

645

646 **Conclusions**

647 In this paper we compare a number of empirical approaches to estimating NCP from
648 satellite data in the Atlantic Ocean. NCP was determined using *in vitro* measurements of
649 changes in dissolved O₂ concentration at 295 stations from 26 cruises in the Atlantic Ocean,
650 Greenland and Mediterranean Seas. Published algorithms based on power laws between NCP
651 and ¹⁴C POC tended to over-estimate NCP at negative values and under-estimate at positive
652 values. By developing a relationship between remotely sensed POC production, SST and
653 NCP, we were able to define a power law which explained >60 % of the variance in *in vitro*
654 measurements of NCP, had the lowest bias and root-mean square error and was within 4 % of
655 the *in vitro* measured values. Using this algorithm with SeaWiFS data, a 13 year time series
656 of NCP was generated to assess spatial and temporal trends over the Atlantic Ocean. The
657 North Atlantic sub-tropical and tropical Gyres remained predominantly net autotrophic from
658 1998 to 2010, suggesting that despite recent warming in the northern hemisphere, this region
659 remains a net sink for CO₂. The South Atlantic sub-tropical Gyre and subtropical
660 convergence zone fluctuated from net autotrophic in austral spring-summer to net
661 heterotrophic in austral autumn-winter, suggesting that over the past decade these provinces
662 are increasingly altering towards a CO₂ source in austral autumn-winter. Over the Atlantic
663 basin from the NADR to SSTC, only ~27 % of the satellite pixels exhibited negative NCP
664 which were mostly from the NATL in temperate autumn-winter and the SATL in austral
665 autumn-winter. Variations in NCP in the northern and southern hemisphere were correlated

666 with climate indices. There were consistent significant negative relationships between
667 monthly and annual anomalies in NCP and MEI in the SATL and NAO in the SSTC. These
668 relationships suggest that climate variability in the Pacific Ocean and North Atlantic may
669 play a role in modifying phases of net autotrophy and heterotrophy in the South Atlantic.

670

671 **Acknowledgements.**

672 We thank the captains and crews of *RRS Charles Darwin* during the BOFS program, *RRS*
673 *James Clark Ross*, *RRS Discovery* and, *RRS James Cook* during the AMT, *RV BioHesperides*
674 during the Bioantar and Threshold campaigns, *RV Jose Rioja* during the CICYT campaign
675 and *NO L'Atlante* and *NO Thalassa* during the POMME campaigns. We are grateful to all
676 data providers for contributing to the database compiled and maintained by CR at
677 <http://www.uea.ac.uk/environmentalsciences/people/People/Faculty+and+Research+Fellow/r>
678 [obinsonc#research](http://www.uea.ac.uk/environmentalsciences/people/People/Faculty+and+Research+Fellow/r) and to those who added additional data from the Atlantic Meridional
679 Transect program from cruises 18 to 21, available at www.amt-uk.org. We also thank the
680 British Oceanographic Data Centre for archiving the data. YX was supported by the Chinese
681 State Scholarship Fund to study in Plymouth Marine Laboratory as a joint PhD student (Grant
682 No. 201206310058). GHT, TP and PS were supported by the contract SCALAR (CTM2011-
683 29616) from the Spanish Ministry of Science. GHT was also supported by the NERC
684 National Capability Atlantic Meridional Transect program. EEG-M was funded by F.P.U.
685 fellowships and a Spanish MEC fellowship CTM2009-08069-E/MAR. NERC Earth
686 Observation Data Archive and Analysis Service, UK (NEODAAS) provided computing
687 facilities and data storage. We would like to thank two anonymous Reviewers whose
688 comments significantly improved the ms. This is AMT publication number 252.

689

690 **References.**

- 691 Agusti, S., Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., Arrieta, J.M., & Duarte, C.M. (2014). Consequences of
 692 UV-enhanced community respiration for plankton metabolic balance. *Limnology and*
 693 *Oceanography*, 59, 223-232
- 694 Aranguren-Gassis, M., Serret, P., Fernandez, E., Herrera, J.L., Dominguez, J.F., Perez, V., &
 695 Escanez, J. (2011). Production and respiration control the marine microbial metabolic balance
 696 in the eastern North Atlantic subtropical gyre. *Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic*
 697 *Research Papers*, 58, 768-775
- 698 Aristegui, J., Montero, M.F., Ballesteros, S., Basterretxea, G., & vanLenning, K. (1996).
 699 Planktonic primary production and microbial respiration measured by C-14 assimilation and
 700 dissolved oxygen changes in coastal waters of the Antarctic Peninsula during austral summer:
 701 Implications for carbon flux studies. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 132, 191-201
- 702 Atkinson, D., Ciotti, B.J., & Montagnes, D.J. (2003). Protists decrease in size linearly with
 703 temperature: ca. 2.5% C⁻¹. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological*
 704 *Sciences*, 270, 2605-2611
- 705 Bailey, S.W., & Werdell, P.J. (2006). A multi-sensor approach for the on-orbit validation of
 706 ocean color satellite data products. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 102, 12-23
- 707 Beaugrand, G., Edwards, M., Brander, K., Luczak, C., & Ibanez, F. (2008). Causes and
 708 projections of abrupt climate-driven ecosystem shifts in the North Atlantic. *Ecology Letters*,
 709 *11*, 1157-1168
- 710 Behrenfeld, M.J., O'Malley, R.T., Siegel, D.A., McClain, C.R., Sarmiento, J.L., Feldman,
 711 G.C., Milligan, A.J., Falkowski, P.G., Letelier, R.M., & Boss, E.S. (2006). Climate-driven
 712 trends in contemporary ocean productivity. *Nature*, 444, 752-755
- 713 Bentsen, M., Drange, H., Furevik, T., & Zhou, T. (2004). Simulated variability of the Atlantic
 714 meridional overturning circulation. *Climate Dynamics*, 22, 701-720
- 715 Campbell, J., Antoine, D., Armstrong, R., Arrigo, K., Balch, W., Barber, R., Behrenfeld, M.,
 716 Bidigare, R., Bishop, J., Carr, M.E., Esaias, W., Falkowski, P., Hoepffner, N., Iverson, R.,
 717 Kiefer, D., Lohrenz, S., Marra, J., Morel, A., Ryan, J., Vedernikov, V., Waters, K., Yentsch,
 718 C., & Yoder, J. (2002). Comparison of algorithms for estimating ocean primary production
 719 from surface chlorophyll, temperature, and irradiance. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 16, art.
 720 no.-1035
- 721 Carr, M.E., Friedrichs, M.A.M., Schmeltz, M., Aita, M.N., Antoine, D., Arrigo, K.R.,
 722 Asanuma, I., Aumont, O., Barber, R., Behrenfeld, M., Bidigare, R., Buitenhuis, E.T.,
 723 Campbell, J., Ciotti, A., Dierssen, H., Dowell, M., Dunne, J., Esaias, W., Gentili, B., Gregg,
 724 W., Groom, S., Hoepffner, N., Ishizaka, J., Kameda, T., Le Quere, C., Lohrenz, S., Marra, J.,
 725 Melin, F., Moore, K., Morel, A., Reddy, T.E., Ryan, J., Scardi, M., Smyth, T., Turpie, K.,
 726 Tilstone, G., Waters, K., & Yamanaka, Y. (2006). A comparison of global estimates of
 727 marine primary production from ocean color. *Deep-Sea Research Part II-Topical Studies in*
 728 *Oceanography*, 53, 741-770
- 729 Chang, C.H., Johnson, N.C., & Cassar, N. (2014). Neural network-based estimates of
 730 Southern Ocean net community production from in situ O₂/Ar and satellite observation: a
 731 methodological study. *Biogeosciences*, 11, 3279-3297
- 732 Cianca, A., Godoy, J.M., Martin, J.M., Perez-Marrero, J., Rueda, M.J., Llinas, O., & Neuer,
 733 S. (2012). Interannual variability of chlorophyll and the influence of low-frequency climate
 734 modes in the North Atlantic subtropical gyre. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26
- 735 Curry, R.G., & McCartney, M.S. (2001). Ocean gyre circulation changes associated with the
 736 North Atlantic Oscillation. *Journal of Physical Oceanography*, 31, 3374-3400
- 737 Doney, S.C. (2006). Oceanography - Plankton in a warmer world. *Nature*, 444, 695-696

738 Doney, S.C. (2010). The Growing Human Footprint on Coastal and Open-Ocean
739 Biogeochemistry. *Science*, 328, 1512-1516

740 Duarte, C.M., Agusti, S., Satta, M.P., & Vaque, D. (1998). Partitioning particulate light
741 absorption: A budget for a Mediterranean bay. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 43, 236-244

742 Duarte, C.M., Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., Arrieta, J.M., Delgado-Huertas, A., & Agusti, S.
743 (2013). The Oligotrophic Ocean Is Heterotrophic. In C.A. Carlson & S.J. Giovannoni (Eds.),
744 *Annual Review of Marine Science*, Vol 5 (pp. 551-569)

745 Duarte, M.C., Agusti, S., Aristegui, J., Gonzalez, N., & Anadon, R. (2001). Evidence for a
746 heterotrophic subtropical northeast Atlantic. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 46, 425-428

747 Ducklow, H.W., & Doney, S.C. (2013). What Is the Metabolic State of the Oligotrophic
748 Ocean? A Debate. In C.A. Carlson & S.J. Giovannoni (Eds.), *Annual Review of Marine*
749 *Science*, Vol 5 (pp. 525-533)

750 Edwards, M., & Richardson, A.J. (2004). Impact of climate change on marine pelagic
751 phenology and trophic mismatch. *Nature*, 430, 881-884

752 Finkel, Z.V., Beardall, J., Flynn, K.J., Quigg, A., Rees, T.A.V., & Raven, J.A. (2010).
753 Phytoplankton in a changing world: cell size and elemental stoichiometry. *JOURNAL OF*
754 *PLANKTON RESEARCH*, 32, 119-137

755 Friedrichs, M.A.M., Carr, M.-E., Barber, R.T., Scardi, M., Antoine, D., Armstrong, R.A.,
756 Asanuma, I., Behrenfeld, M.J., Buitenhuis, E.T., Chai, F., Christian, J.R., Ciotti, A.M.,
757 Doney, S.C., Dowell, M., Dunne, J., Gentili, B., Gregg, W., Hoepffner, N., Ishizaka, J.,
758 Kameda, T., Lima, I., Marra, J., Melin, F., Moore, J.K., Morel, A., O'Malley, R.T., O'Reilly,
759 J., Saba, V.S., Schmeltz, M., Smyth, T.J., Tjiputra, J., Waters, K., Westberry, T.K., &
760 Winguth, A. (2009). Assessing the uncertainties of model estimates of primary productivity
761 in the tropical Pacific Ocean. *Journal of Marine Systems*, 76, 113-133

762 García-Corral, L.S., Barber, E., Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., Sal, S., Holding, J.M., Agustí, S.,
763 Navarro, N., Serret, P., Mozetič, P., & Duarte, D.M. (2014). Temperature dependence of
764 planktonic metabolism in the subtropical North Atlantic Ocean. *Biogeosciences*, 11, 4529-
765 4540

766 Gillooly, J.F., Brown, J.H., West, G.B., Savage, V.M., & Charnov, E.L. (2001). Effects of
767 size and temperature on metabolic rate. *Science*, 293, 2248-2251

768 Gist, N., Serret, P., Woodward, E.M.S., Chamberlain, K., & Robinson, C. (2009). Seasonal
769 and spatial variability in plankton production and respiration in the Subtropical Gyres of the
770 Atlantic Ocean. *Deep-Sea Research Part II-Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 56, 931-940

771 Gonzalez, N., Anadon, R., & Maranon, E. (2002). Large-scale variability of planktonic net
772 community metabolism in the Atlantic Ocean: importance of temporal changes in
773 oligotrophic subtropical waters. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 233, 21-30

774 Hakkinen, S., & Rhines, P.B. (2004). Decline of subpolar North Atlantic circulation during
775 the 1990s. *Science*, 304, 555-559

776 Henson, S.A., Raitos, D., Dunne, J.P., & McQuatters-Gollop, A. (2009). Decadal variability
777 in biogeochemical models: Comparison with a 50-year ocean colour dataset. *Geophysical*
778 *Research Letters*, 36

779 Henson, S.A., Sanders, R., & Madsen, E. (2012). Global patterns in efficiency of particulate
780 organic carbon export and transfer to the deep ocean. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26

781 Holligan, P.M., Fernandez, E., Aiken, J., Balch, W.M., Boyd, P., Burkill, P.H., Finch, M.,
782 Groom, S.B., Malin, G., Muller, K., Purdie, D.A., Robinson, C., Trees, C.C., Turner, S.M., &
783 Vanderwal, P. (1993). A biogeochemical study of the coccolithophore, *emiliania-huxleyi*, in
784 the north-atlantic. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 7, 879-900

785 Hurrell, J.W., & Deser, C. (2009). North Atlantic climate variability: The role of the North
786 Atlantic Oscillation. *Journal of Marine Systems*, 78, 28-41

787 Ineson, S., & Scaife, A.A. (2009). The role of the stratosphere in the European climate
788 response to El Niño. *Nature Geoscience*, 2, 32-36

789 Jones, P.D., Lister, D.H., Osborn, T.J., Harpham, C., Salmon, M., & Morice, C.P. (2012).
790 Hemispheric and large-scale land-surface air temperature variations: An extensive revision
791 and an update to 2010. *Journal of Geophysical Research-Atmospheres*, 117

792 Juranek, L.W., & Quay, P.D. (2013). Using Triple Isotopes of Dissolved Oxygen to Evaluate
793 Global Marine Productivity. In C.A. Carlson & S.J. Giovannoni (Eds.), *Annual Review of*
794 *Marine Science*, Vol 5 (pp. 503-524)

795 Kaiser, J. (2011). Technical note: Consistent calculation of aquatic gross production from
796 oxygen triple isotope measurements. *Biogeosciences*, 8, 1793-1811

797 Kitidis, V., Tilstone, G., Serret, P., Smyth, T., Torres, R., & Robinson, C. (2014). Oxygen
798 photolysis in the Mauritanian upwelling: Implications for net community production.
799 *Limnology and Oceanography*, 59, 299-310

800 Lau, N.C., & Nath, M.J. (2001). Impact of ENSO on SST variability in the North Pacific and
801 North Atlantic: Seasonal dependence and role of extratropical sea-air coupling. *Journal of*
802 *Climate*, 14, 2846-2866

803 Laws, E.A. (1991). Photosynthetic quotients, new production and net community production
804 in the open ocean. *Deep-Sea Research Part a-Oceanographic Research Papers*, 38, 143-167

805 Li, F., Jo, Y.-H., Liu, W.T., & Yan, X.-H. (2012). A dipole pattern of the sea surface height
806 anomaly in the North Atlantic: 1990s-2000s. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 39

807 Lopez-Urrutia, A., San Martin, E., Harris, R.P., & Irigoien, X. (2006). Scaling the metabolic
808 balance of the oceans. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States*
809 *of America*, 103, 8739-8744

810 Maixandau, A., Lefevre, D., Fernandez, I.C., Sempere, R., Sohrin, R., Ras, J., Van
811 Wambeke, F., Caniaux, G., & Queguiner, B. (2005a). Mesoscale and seasonal variability of
812 community production and respiration in the surface waters of the NE Atlantic Ocean. *Deep-*
813 *Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research Papers*, 52, 1663-1676

814 Maixandau, A., Lefevre, D., Karayanni, H., Christaki, U., Van Wambeke, F., Thyssen, M.,
815 Denis, M., Fernandez, C.I., Uitz, J., Leblanc, K., & Queguiner, B. (2005b). Microbial
816 community production, respiration, and structure of the microbial food web of an ecosystem
817 in the northeastern Atlantic Ocean. *Journal of Geophysical Research-Oceans*, 110

818 Marra, J. (2009). Net and gross productivity: weighing in with C-14. *Aquatic Microbial*
819 *Ecology*, 56, 123-131

820 McQuatters-Gollop, A., Mee, L.D., Raitos, D.E., & Shapiro, G.I. (2008). Non-linearities,
821 regime shifts and recovery: The recent influence of climate on Black Sea chlorophyll.
822 *Journal of Marine Systems*, 74, 649-658

823 Melin, F., Zibordi, G., & Berthon, J.-F. (2007). Assessment of satellite ocean color products
824 at a coastal site. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 110, 192-215

825 Morán, X.A.G., López-Urrutia, Á., Calvo-Díaz, A., & Li, W.K.W. (2010). Increasing
826 importance of small phytoplankton in a warmer ocean. *Global Change Biology*, 16, 1137-
827 1144

828 Morel, A. (1991). Light and Marine Photosynthesis - a Spectral Model with Geochemical and
829 Climatological Implications. *Progress in Oceanography*, 26, 263-306

830 Nevison, C.D., Keeling, R.F., Kahru, M., Manizza, M., Mitchell, B.G., & Cassar, N. (2012).
831 Estimating net community production in the Southern Ocean based on atmospheric potential
832 oxygen and satellite ocean color data. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26

833 Park, J., Oh, I.-S., Kim, H.-C., & Yoo, S. (2010). Variability of SeaWiFs chlorophyll-a in the
834 southwest Atlantic sector of the Southern Ocean: Strong topographic effects and weak
835 seasonality. *Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research Papers*, 57, 604-620

836 Pennington, J.T., Mahoney, K.L., Kuwahara, V.S., Kolber, D.D., Calienes, R., & Chavez,
837 F.P. (2006). Primary production in the eastern tropical Pacific: A review. *Progress in*
838 *Oceanography*, 69, 285-317

839 Perkins, D.M., Yvon-Durocher, G., Demars, B.O.L., Reiss, J., Pichler, D.E., Friberg, N.,
840 Trimmer, M., & Woodward, G. (2012). Consistent temperature dependence of respiration
841 across ecosystems contrasting in thermal history. *Global Change Biology*, 18, 1300-1311

842 Polovina, J.J., Howell, E.A., & Abecassis, M. (2008). Ocean's least productive waters are
843 expanding. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 35

844 Poulton, A.J., Holligan, P.M., Hickman, A., Kim, Y.N., Adey, T.R., Stinchcombe, M.C.,
845 Holeton, C., Root, S., & Woodward, E.M.S. (2006). Phytoplankton carbon fixation,
846 chlorophyll-biomass and diagnostic pigments in the Atlantic Ocean. *Deep-Sea Research Part*
847 *II-Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 53, 1593-1610

848 Pyper, B.J., Peterman, R.M. (1998). Comparison of methods to account for autocorrelation in
849 correlation analyses of fish data. *Canadian Journal of Fish Aquatic Sciences* 55: 2127–2140

850 Raitos, D.E., Lavender, S.J., Pradhan, Y., Tyrrell, T., Reid, P.C., & Edwards, M. (2006).
851 Coccolithophore bloom size variation in response to the regional environment of the subarctic
852 North Atlantic. *Limnology and Oceanography*, 51, 2122-2130

853 Raitos, D.E., Pradhan, Y., Lavender, S.J., Hoteit, I., McQuatters-Gollop, A., Reid, P.C., &
854 Richardson, A.J. (2014). From silk to satellite: half a century of ocean colour anomalies in
855 the Northeast Atlantic. *Global Change Biology*, 20, 2117-2123

856 Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., Agusti, S., & Duarte, C.M. (2014). UV sensitivity of planktonic net
857 community production in ocean surface waters. *Journal of Geophysical Research-*
858 *Biogeosciences*, 119, 929-936

859 Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., & Duarte, C.M. (2010). Compensation irradiance for planktonic
860 community metabolism in the ocean. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 24

861 Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., & Duarte, C.M. (2012). Temperature dependence of planktonic
862 metabolism in the ocean. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26

863 Regaudie-de-Gioux, A., Vaquer-Sunyer, R., & Duarte, C.M. (2009). Patterns in planktonic
864 metabolism in the Mediterranean Sea. *Biogeosciences*, 6, 3081-3089

865 Richardson, A.J., & Schoeman, D.S. (2004). Climate impact on plankton ecosystems in the
866 Northeast Atlantic. *Science*, 305, 1609-1612

867 Robinson, C., Tilstone, G.H., Rees, A.P., Smyth, T.J., Fishwick, J.R., Tarran, G.A., Luz, B.,
868 Barkan, E., & David, E. (2009). Comparison of in vitro and in situ plankton production
869 determinations. *Aquatic Microbial Ecology*, 54, 13-34

870 Robinson, C., & Williams, P.J.B. (2005). Respiration and its measurement in surface waters.
871 In P.A. del Giorgio & P.J.B. Williams (Eds.), *Respiration in Aquatic Ecosystems* (pp. 147–
872 180). Oxford, U. K: Oxford Univ. Press

873 Saba, V.S., Friedrichs, M.A.M., Carr, M.-E., Antoine, D., Armstrong, R.A., Asanuma, I.,
874 Aumont, O., Bates, N.R., Behrenfeld, M.J., Bennington, V., Bopp, L., Bruggeman, J.,
875 Buitenhuis, E.T., Church, M.J., Ciotti, A.M., Doney, S.C., Dowell, M., Dunne, J.,
876 Dutkiewicz, S., Gregg, W., Hoepffner, N., Hyde, K.J.W., Ishizaka, J., Kameda, T., Karl,
877 D.M., Lima, I., Lomas, M.W., Marra, J., McKinley, G.A., Melin, F., Moore, J.K., Morel, A.,
878 O'Reilly, J., Salihoglu, B., Scardi, M., Smyth, T.J., Tang, S., Tjiputra, J., Uitz, J., Vichi, M.,
879 Waters, K., Westberry, T.K., & Yool, A. (2010). Challenges of modeling depth-integrated
880 marine primary productivity over multiple decades: A case study at BATS and HOT. *Global*
881 *Biogeochemical Cycles*, 24

882 Serret, P., Fernandez, E., & Robinson, C. (2002). Biogeographic differences in the net
883 ecosystem metabolism of the open ocean. *Ecology*, 83, 3225-3234

884 Serret, P., Fernandez, E., Sostres, J.A., & Anadon, R. (1999). Seasonal compensation of
885 microbial production and respiration in a temperate sea. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*,
886 187, 43-57

887 Serret, P., Robinson, C., Fernandez, E., Teira, E., & Tilstone, G. (2001). Latitudinal variation
888 of the balance between plankton photosynthesis and respiration in the eastern Atlantic Ocean.
889 *Limnology and Oceanography*, 46, 1642-1652

890 Serret, P., Robinson, C., Fernandez, E., Teira, E., Tilstone, G., & Perez, V. (2009). Predicting
891 plankton net community production in the Atlantic Ocean. *Deep-Sea Research Part II-*
892 *Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 56, 941-953

893 Shutler, J.D., Davidson, K., Miller, P.I., Swan, S.C., Grant, M.G., & Bresnan, E. (2012). An
894 adaptive approach to detect high-biomass algal blooms from EO chlorophyll-a data in support
895 of harmful algal bloom monitoring. *Remote Sensing Letters*, 3, 101-110

896 Smyth, T.J., Tilstone, G.H., & Groom, S.B. (2005). Integration of radiative transfer into
897 satellite models of ocean primary production. *Journal of Geophysical Research-Oceans*, 110

898 Sokal, R.R., & Rolf, F.J. (1997). *Biometry*. New York: W.H. Freeman and Company.

899 Tilstone, G., Smyth, T., Poulton, A., & Hutson, R. (2009). Measured and remotely sensed
900 estimates of primary production in the Atlantic Ocean from 1998 to 2005. *Deep-Sea*
901 *Research Part II-Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 56, 918-930

902 Tzanatos, E., Raitzos, D.E., Triantafyllou, G., Somarakis, S., Tsonis, A.A. (2014). Indications
903 of a climate effect on Mediterranean fisheries. *Climatic Change*, 122: 41-54

904 Westberry, T.K., Williams, P.J.I.B., & Behrenfeld, M.J. (2012). Global net community
905 production and the putative net heterotrophy of the oligotrophic oceans. *Global*
906 *Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26

907 Williams, P.J.I.B. (1998). The balance of plankton respiration and photosynthesis in the open
908 oceans. *Nature*, 394, 55-57

909 Williams, P.J.I.B., Quay, P.D., Westberry, T.K., & Behrenfeld, M.J. (2013). The Oligotrophic
910 Ocean Is Autotrophic. *Annual Review of Marine Science*, Vol 5, 5, 535-549

911 Wolter, K., & Timlin, M.S. (2011). El Nino/Southern Oscillation behaviour since 1871 as
912 diagnosed in an extended multivariate ENSO index (MEI.ext). *International Journal of*
913 *Climatology*, 31, 1074-1087

914 Zhai, L., Gudmundsson, K., Miller, P., Peng, W., Gudfinnsson, H., Debes, H., Hatun, H.,
915 White, G.N., III, Hernandez Walls, R., Sathyendranath, S., & Platt, T. (2012). Phytoplankton
916 phenology and production around Iceland and Faroes. *Continental Shelf Research*, 37, 15-25

917 Zibordi, G., Melin, F., & Berthon, J.F. (2006). Comparison of SeaWiFS, MODIS and MERIS
918 radiometric products at a coastal site. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 33

919

920

921 **Table 1.** Location and dates of cruises for the collection of *in vitro* net community production (NCP) data. BODC is British Oceanographic Data
 922 Centre. Data from AMT cruises 11 to 21 were used for calibration (C) and validation (V) of the algorithms. All other data were used for validation
 923 only.

| Cruise Name | Vessel | Dates | Location | No of stations | Reference |
|---------------|---|--|-------------|----------------|---|
| CD046- BOFS | <i>RRS Charles Darwin</i> | 01 May-14 June 1990 | NADR | 13 | (Williams 1998) |
| CD060- BOFS | <i>RRS Charles Darwin</i> | 16-29 June 1991 | N Atlantic | 3 | (Holligan et al. 1993) |
| Bioantar 93 | <i>RV BioHespérides</i> | 05 - 14 Feb 1994 | Antarctic | 4 | (Aristegui et al. 1996) |
| CICYT AMB | <i>RV José Rioja</i> | 01 March – 01 Sept 1994 | NAST-E | 14 | (Serret et al. 1999) |
| CICYT AMB | <i>RV José Rioja</i> | 01 Oct 1994 – 01 June 1995 | NAST-E | 21 | (Serret et al. 1999) |
| AMT4 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 01 April 1997 | NADR – SATL | 13 | (Gonzalez et al. 2002) |
| AMT5 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 01 Sept 1997 | SATL - NADR | 11 | (Gonzalez et al. 2002) |
| Bay of Biscay | <i>RV José Rioja</i> | 01 April – 03 Aug 1999 | NADR | 8 | (Gonzalez et al. 2003) |
| POMME | <i>NO L'Atlante</i> <i>NO Thalassa</i> | 28 Sept – 03 Oct 2000, 07 – 23 March 2001, 02 May 2001, 20 Sept – 03 Oct 2001. | NAST-E | 23 | (Maixandeu et al. 2005a; Maixandeu et al. 2005b) |

| | | | | | |
|--------------|-----------------------------|--|----------------------|-------------------|---|
| AMT12 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 23 May – 11 June 2003 | SATL - NADR | C=7; V=12 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| AMT13 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 18 Sept – 7 Oct 2003 | NADR - SATL | C=9; V=10 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| AMT14 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 5 – 29 May 2004 | SATL - NADR | C=8; V=12 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| AMT15 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 21 Sept – 24 Oct 2004 | NADR - SATL | C=7; V=12 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| AMT16 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 26 May – 24 June 2005 | SATL - NADR | C=8; V=11 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| AMT17 | <i>RRS Discovery</i> | 28 Oct – 6 Nov 2005 | NADR - SATL | 7 | (Gist et al. 2009) |
| Threshold | <i>RV BioHespérides</i> | 04 June – 04 July 2006, 06 May – 01 July 2007 | Mediterranean Sea | 8 | (Regaudie-de-Gioux et al. 2009) |
| CARPOS | <i>RV BioHespérides</i> | 14 Oct – 21 Nov 2006 | NAST-E | 16 | (Aranguren-Gassis et al. 2011) |
| ATOS | <i>RV BioHespérides</i> | 01 – 25 July 2007 | Greenland Sea | 8 | (Regaudie-de-Gioux and Duarte 2010) |
| AMT18 | <i>RRS James Clark Ross</i> | 16 Sept – 21 Oct 2008 | NADR - SATL | C=7; V=11 | BODC |
| AMT21 | <i>RRS Discovery</i> | 02 Oct – 08 Nov 2011 | NADR - SATL | C=15; V=16 | BODC |
| TOTAL | | | | 295 (C=61) | |

924 **Table 2.** Performance indices for relative errors in NCP algorithms using *in vitro*, MODIS and SeaWiFS data as input. Log-difference errors in
925 measured and satellite estimates are given as Mean (*M*), Standard deviation (*S*), Root Mean Square Error (RMSE) and root-mean square (Log-RMS).
926 The geometric mean and one-sigma range of the difference ($F = \text{Value}_{\text{meas}} - \text{Value}_{\text{alg}}$) are given by F_{med} , F_{min} , and F_{max} , respectively; values closer to 1
927 are more accurate. *N* is the number of data used. Percentage variability explained (r^2), slope and intercept are for log-log regression. The most accurate
928 algorithm is highlighted in bold.

| | Model | N | APD | UPD | Inter | Slope | R ² | M | S | RMSE | Log-RMS | F _{med} | F _{max} | F _{min} |
|-------------------------------------|-------|----|------------|-------------|--------------------|------------------|----------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| <i>In Situ</i> data | NCP-A | 84 | 3.4 | -0.6 | -89.81±5.78 | 1.00±0.10 | 0.53 | 0.29 | 0.29 | 103.43 | 0.41 | 1.96 | 3.81 | 1.00 |
| | NCP-B | 84 | 3.5 | -1.2 | 29.80±2.83 | 0.43±0.05 | 0.46 | -0.05 | 0.08 | 46.47 | 0.09 | 0.89 | 1.06 | 0.75 |
| | NCP-C | 84 | 3.1 | 1.0 | -1.00±3.47 | 0.54±0.06 | 0.47 | 0.01 | 0.08 | 40.10 | 0.08 | 1.02 | 1.22 | 0.85 |
| | NCP-D | 84 | 3.1 | 0.7 | -5.83±3.26 | 0.64±0.06 | 0.58 | 0.02 | 0.07 | 35.60 | 0.07 | 1.04 | 1.22 | 0.88 |
| Sea WiFS (3 x 3 pixels) | NCP-A | 13 | 10.9 | 5.8 | -97.32±24.24 | 2.05±-0.65 | 0.48 | 0.47 | 0.46 | 103.63 | 0.70 | 2.93 | 8.37 | 1.03 |
| | NCP-B | 13 | 8.6 | 2.8 | 28.77±8.74 | 0.81±0.23 | 0.53 | -0.06 | 0.07 | 34.48 | 0.10 | 0.86 | 1.01 | 0.74 |
| | NCP-C | 13 | 2.3 | -1.2 | -2.78±11.27 | 1.03±0.30 | 0.52 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 30.31 | 0.08 | 1.03 | 1.23 | 0.85 |
| | NCP-D | 13 | 1.8 | -0.9 | -4.89±9.67 | 1.06±0.26 | 0.61 | 0.02 | 0.08 | 26.64 | 0.08 | 1.06 | 1.26 | 0.89 |
| MODIS- Aqua (3 x 3 pixels) | NCP-A | 18 | 14.3 | -13.6 | -71.08±14.98 | 1.55±0.44 | 0.25 | 0.45 | 0.53 | 96.81 | 0.72 | 2.81 | 9.45 | 0.83 |
| | NCP-B | 18 | 5.3 | 2.6 | 38.10±6.09 | 0.61±0.18 | 0.21 | -0.09 | 0.08 | 48.26 | 0.13 | 0.81 | 0.97 | 0.67 |
| | NCP-C | 18 | 3.8 | -2.0 | 9.34±7.69 | 0.77±0.22 | 0.22 | -0.02 | 0.09 | 34.04 | 0.09 | 0.96 | 1.17 | 0.78 |
| | NCP-D | 18 | 3.7 | 0.9 | 1.82±7.21 | 0.70±0.21 | 0.18 | 0.00 | 0.09 | 29.70 | 0.09 | 0.99 | 1.21 | 0.82 |

929

930 **Table 3.** Mean, standard deviation, minimum and maximum net community production from NCP_C and NCP_D for Atlantic Ocean provinces over all
 931 seasons (All) and boreal spring, summer, autumn and winter from 1998 to 2010.

| NCP_C | NADR | NATL | CNRY | ETRA | WTRA | BENG | SATL | SSTC |
|------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| All | 42 ± 38 | 23 ± 9 | 121 ± 18 | 75 ± 18 | 50 ± 9 | 80 ± 14 | 10 ± 6 | 33 ± 28 |
| | -22 - 107 | 7 - 42 | 87 - 167 | 42 - 114 | 28 - 76 | 51 - 114 | 0 - 38 | -10 - 89 |
| Spring | 64 ± 25 | 31 ± 4 | 142 ± 11 | 61 ± 9 | 44 ± 5 | 79 ± 10 | 4 ± 2 | 23 ± 17 |
| | 23 - 103 | 27 - 42 | 119 - 167 | 42 - 79 | 28 - 52 | 62 - 99 | 0 - 9 | 1 - 68 |
| Summer | 80 ± 15 | 29 ± 4 | 122 ± 4 | 95 ± 12 | 60 ± 8 | 63 ± 6 | 10 ± 6 | -1 ± 17 |
| | 48 - 107 | 20 - 40 | 94 - 153 | 73 - 114 | 42 - 76 | 51 - 82 | 2 - 31 | -10 - 37 |
| Autumn | 30 ± 18 | 15 ± 5 | 109 ± 12 | 80 ± 14 | 52 ± 7 | 88 ± 10 | 16 ± 6 | 44 ± 19 |
| | 2 - 62 | 7 - 25 | 89 - 155 | 61 - 107 | 37 - 66 | 65 - 106 | 8 - 38 | 15 - 88 |
| Winter | -8 ± 10 | 17 ± 6 | 112 ± 13 | 63 ± 7 | 46 ± 6 | 91 ± 8 | 10 ± 3 | 65 ± 9 |
| | -22 - 12 | 7 - 30 | 87 - 142 | 48 - 77 | 33 - 59 | 51 - 114 | 3 - 14 | 49 - 89 |
| NCP_D | | | | | | | | |
| All | 64 ± 39 | 10 ± 12 | 97 ± 26 | 39 ± 19 | 17 ± 8 | 86 ± 13 | 4 ± 10 | 68 ± 32 |
| | -2 - 135 | -13 - 33 | 48 - 150 | 6 - 82 | -7 - 37 | 62 - 116 | -12 - 34 | 15 - 131 |
| Spring | 98 ± 25 | 25 ± 3 | 96 ± 19 | 20 ± 8 | 11 ± 5 | 77 ± 7 | -8 ± 2 | 50 ± 16 |
| | 56 - 135 | 19 - 33 | 55 - 124 | 6 - 36 | -7 - 20 | 63 - 96 | -12 - -3 | 26 - 88 |
| Summer | 93 ± 22 | 10 ± 6 | 96 ± 19 | 60 ± 15 | 24 ± 8 | 78 ± 8 | 8 ± 8 | 31 ± 11 |
| | 49 - 134 | 0 - 23 | 67 - 134 | 21 - 82 | 3 - 37 | 62 - 98 | -6 - 26 | 15 - 62 |
| Autumn | 43 ± 15 | -4 ± 3 | 70 ± 11 | 49 ± 14 | 18 ± 6 | 102 ± 7 | 16 ± 6 | 90 ± 21 |
| | 18 - 69 | -13 - 0 | 48 - 105 | 30 - 76 | 5 - 31 | 86 - 116 | 8 - 38 | 59 - 131 |
| Winter | 17 ± 13 | 7 ± 9 | 96 ± 19 | 28 ± 8 | 14 ± 5 | 91 ± 8 | -1 ± 5 | 99 ± 33 |
| | -2 - 42 | -11 - 24 | 55 - 124 | 14 - 46 | 6 - 26 | 74 - 114 | -10 - 11 | 75 - 131 |

932

933 **Table 4.** Significant Pearson correlation coefficient between climate indices and mean monthly anomaly in satellite Net community Production (NCP_D)
 934 and mean annual NCP_D (N=12). North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO), multivariate ENSO index (MEI), and Northern Hemisphere Temperature (NHT),
 935 for different Atlantic provinces from 1998-2010. r is correlation coefficient and p is level of significance after correcting for temporal autocorrelation.
 936 * indicates significant correlation at the 5% level; ** is 0.5% level and *** is 0.05% level. For province descriptions see Fig. 1.

| NCP _D | Correlation coefficient | Monthly-NAO | Annual-NAO | Monthly-MEI | Annual-MEI | Monthly-NHT | Annual-NHT |
|------------------|-------------------------|------------------|---------------------|----------------------|------------------|---------------|------------------|
| CNRY | r P | | 0.802 0.001** | | | | |
| ETRA | r P | | | | | | -0.676 0.022* |
| WTRA | r P | | 0.599 0.05* | | | | |
| SATL | r P | | | -0.385 <0.0001*** | -0.601 0.039* | | |
| SSTC | r P | -0.180 0.036* | -0.909 <0.001*** | | | 0.203 0.06 | |

937
 938
 939

940 **LEGENDS**

941 Fig. 1. Sampling stations for *in vitro* measurements of net community production in the (a.)
942 Atlantic Ocean, Antarctic, Mediterranean and Greenland Seas; (b.) *in vitro* measurements
943 taken during April-May-June only and (c.) *in vitro* measurements taken during Sept-Oct-Nov.
944 Bold open circles indicate stations with satellite match-ups from SeaWiFS; bold open squares
945 indicate stations with satellite match-ups from MODIS-Aqua. NADR is North Atlantic Drift
946 Province, NATL is North Atlantic Tropical Gyre, CNRY is Canary Current Coastal
947 upwelling, WTRA is Western Tropical Atlantic, ETRA is Eastern Tropical Atlantic, SATL is
948 South Atlantic Subtropical Gyre, BENG is Benguela Current Coastal, SSTC is South
949 Subtropical Convergence.

950 Fig. 2. (a.) Power law between *in vitro* net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) and ^{14}C
951 POC ($\text{mmol C m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) used to parameterise NCP_C and (b.) additional relationship between
952 *in vitro* net community production and sea surface temperature used to parameterise NCP_D .

953 Fig. 3. Comparison of *in vitro* measured and modelled (using measured ^{14}C POC and SST)
954 net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) for the Atlantic Ocean using half of the *in vitro*
955 data shown in Fig. 1 to validate (a.) NCP_A (b.) NCP_B (c.) NCP_C (d.) NCP_D . For description of
956 algorithms refer to Section 2. Solid line is the 1:1 line and dashed line is ordinary least
957 squares regression. Open squares are data from AMT6, included for comparative purposes
958 and were not used to calculate validation metrics given in Table 2.

959 Fig. 4. Comparison of *in vitro* measurements and satellite estimates of net community
960 production for (a.) NCP_A (b.) NCP_B (c.) NCP_C (d.) NCP_D . Solid circles are SeaWiFS; open
961 diamonds are MODIS-Aqua. Solid line is the 1:1 line, dashed line is the ordinary least
962 squares regression for SeaWiFS and dotted line is the ordinary least squares regression for
963 MODIS-Aqua.

964 Fig 5. Mean annual satellite maps of net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) for the
965 Atlantic Ocean from 1998 to 2010 using the NCP_C (left hand panel) and NCP_D (centre panel)
966 with SeaWiFS data and difference between $\text{NCP}_C - \text{NCP}_D$ (right hand panel). Bottom colour
967 bar is NCP values for NCP_C and NCP_D . Top colour bar indicates extent of difference between
968 $\text{NCP}_C - \text{NCP}_D$; positive values indicate $\text{NCP}_C > \text{NCP}_D$; negative values indicate $\text{NCP}_D > \text{NCP}_C$.

969 Fig. 6. Mean monthly variation in net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) using NCP_C
970 with SeaWiFS data from 1998 to 2010 in eight Provinces as described in Fig. 1. Dotted line
971 represents metabolic net balance, grey shaded area represents maximum and minimum range;
972 box whisker plots are mean, minimum and maximum range in mean monthly *in vitro*
973 measurements of NCP.

974 Fig. 7. Mean monthly variation in net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) using NCP_D
975 with SeaWiFS data from 1998 to 2010 in eight Provinces as described in Fig. 1. Dotted line
976 represents metabolic net balance, grey shaded area represents maximum and minimum range;
977 box whisker plots are mean, minimum and maximum range in mean monthly *in vitro*
978 measurements of NCP.

979 Fig. 8. Mean seasonal climatology in net community production ($\text{mmol O}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$) using
980 NCP_D with SeaWiFS data from 1998-2010 for boreal (a.) Spring, (b.) Summer, (c.) Autumn
981 and (d.) Winter. Pixels coloured dark blue indicate negative NCP (i.e. net heterotrophy).

982 Fig 9. Percentage of pixels with negative NCP from mean seasonal climatology given in Fig.
983 7 for Boreal Spring, Summer, Autumn and Winter in the NATL (a.), WTRA (b.), SATL (c.)
984 and Atlantic Ocean from all provinces (d.). Bold symbols are mean values for SeaWiFS time
985 series from 1998-2010; coloured lines and smaller symbols represent percentage values for
986 individual years to indicate variation between years.

987 Fig. 10. Mean annual cumulative sums in the anomalies of net community production for
988 NCP_D (open circles) and climate indices (crosses) in the (a.) NADR, (b.) NATL, (c.) CNRY,
989 (d.) WTRA, (e.) ETRA, (f.) SATL, (g.) BENG and (h.) SSTC from 1998-2010. Mean annual
990 NCP_D (solid circles) and climate mean annual indices (open squares) for the (i.) NADR, (j.)
991 NATL, (k.) CNRY, (l.) WTRA, (m.) ETRA, (n.) SATL, (o.) BENG and (p.) SSTC.
992 Significant correlations with climate indices are given after correction for temporal
993 autocorrelation. The climate indices are; Multivariate ENSO Index (MEI), North Atlantic
994 Oscillation Index (NAO) and Northern Hemisphere Temperature (NHT) . For definition of
995 provinces refer to [Fig. 1](#).